



Management Service

Action List

Organization name	PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM
Standard(s)	ISO 9001:2015
Order No.	724611300
Audit start date	2022-08-01
Audit end date	2022-08-02
Audit type	3. Repeat-Audit
Certification type	Single
Identification No.	130623-01

Classification of Audit Findings

An audit cannot cover each and every detail of the management system. Therefore, there may still be nonconformities not addressed by the auditors in the closing meeting or the audit report. Audit results are always evaluated on the basis of the following classification:

Nonconformity (NC):

Failure to fulfill one or more requirements of the management system standard, or a situation that raises significant doubts about the capability of the customer's management system to achieve its intended results. The auditor verifies in a re-audit that the nonconformity has been effectively closed.

Minor nonconformity (MiN):

In individual cases, some of the requirements of the management system standard are not fulfilled completely. However, this does not affect the capability of the management system to achieve the intended results.

Opportunity for improvement (I):

The requirement of the Standard has been effectively implemented, but system performance regarding the relevant requirement offers room for improvement in terms of effectiveness and efficiency. Implementation is recommended.

Positive aspects (P):

Positive aspects of the management system meriting special mention.

Evaluation	Submission of corrections and corrective actions	Implementation of corrective actions
Opportunities for improvement (I):	Implementation only recommended	
Minor nonconformities (MiN)	Within 14 calendar days	By the next audit at the latest Verification in the next audit
Nonconformities (NC)	Within 14 calendar days	Within 90 calendar days Verification by re-audit

Note: Deadlines must be met in order to ensure the status of certification.

All elements in each clause of the Standard(s) were found to be "in conformity/effective" except for those elements of the Standard for which this document includes nonconformities or minor nonconformities.

Nonconformities

All audit results gathered by the audit team during the audit (certification audit, special audit, change audit, recertification audit, re-audit, surveillance audit) shall be listed in the table below.

No.	1	Standard:	ISO 9001		Type:	MIN
Site:	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog					
Clause no.	7.1.2 (9K)	Process / area:	HR/ Training			
Audit results: <i>(filled out by auditor)</i>	Finding:	The recruitment process as documented was not followed on the following sampled new hires: - Milker - Animal Caretaker Noted further that the Roles and Responsibilities stated in the Service Agreements were different from the respective documented job descriptions.				
	Evidence:	No evidence that screening process was performed Service Agreement Requisition Form Job Descriptions for Milker and Animal Caretaker				
Action: (filled out by organization)						
Correction: <i>(immediate)</i>						
	when ?		who ?			
Root cause: <i>(Why did the nonconformity occur; no repetition of the finding)</i>						
Corrective: <i>(action to avoid repetition of root cause)</i>						
	when ?		who ?			
Auditor's decision of correction and corrective action: (filled out by auditor)						
Correction:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:	
Corrective:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:	



No.	2	Standard:	ISO 9001	Type:	MIN
Site:	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
Clause no.	7.1.5 (9K)	Process / area:	Various Areas		
Audit results: (filled out by auditor)	Finding:	<p>Milk and Milk Products: It could not be established that all temperature indicators used at milk processing at the time of audit have been subjected to calibration. Last calibration certificate presented was still in July 14, 2021. Frequency of calibration is supposedly annually. All thermometers have accordingly been sent to the calibration institution just recently.</p> <p>Maintenance: - No verification/calibration of temperture indicators for storage tank for raw milk. Noted that this was monitored every 30 mins to avoid milk spoilage. - Although freezers/chillers were checked daily. verification of actual temperatures as part of inspection activities were not yet practiced.</p>			
	Evidence:	No evidence presented			

Action: (filled out by organization)

Correction: (immediate)					
	when ?		who ?		

Root cause: (Why did the nonconformity occur; no repetition of the finding)					
--	--	--	--	--	--

Corrective: (action to avoid repetition of root cause)					
	when ?		who ?		

Auditor's decision of correction and corrective action: (filled out by auditor)

Correction:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:	
Corrective:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:	

No.	3	Standard:	ISO 9001	Type:	MIN
Site:	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				



Clause no.		8.3 (9K)	Process / area:		Research and Development
Audit results: (filled out by auditor)	Finding:	It could not be established that the timeline set for research projects is being strictly monitored, and reasons for delay are not being consistently documented.			
	Evidence:	GANTT chart for the research project 'Post-Partum Management to Improve Artificial Insemination Efficiency in Water Buffaloes at Village Condition' that started on March 1, 2017 supposedly scheduled for 12 months, but actual is already running 5 years and not yet completed, yet, Gantt chart was not updated and reasons of delay not clearly recorded.			
Action: (filled out by organization)					
Correction: (immediate)					
	when ?		who ?		
Root cause: (Why did the nonconformity occur; no repetition of the finding)					
Corrective: (action to avoid repetition of root cause)					
	when ?		who ?		
Auditor's decision of correction and corrective action: (filled out by auditor)					
Correction:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:
Corrective:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:
No.	4	Standard:	ISO 9001	Type:	MIN
Site:	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
Clause no.	8.4.1 (9K)	Process / area:		Purchasing / Artificial Insemination	



Audit results: (filled out by auditor)	Finding:	<p><u>Purchasing:</u> Adequate control that must be applied to external providers cannot be fully demonstrated as the following were noted: - Noted that as per procedure, supplier's accreditation must be renewed annually, but sampled supplier, Pacifica Agrivet Supplies Inc. with recent transaction is not part of the masterlist of accredited suppliers and was not evaluated for year 2021 - Noted that the rehabilitation of the following were awarded to JY Bontilao: - PCC-USF Office Building - Dairy and marketing building Noted that contract prices of the above separate scopes were significantly high but there was no contract agreement entered between parties. Noted that as per PO, there is corresponding penalty for every day delay but contract duration was not stipulated in the PO.</p> <p><u>Artificial Insemination:</u> It could not be established if accredited AI technicians are regularly evaluated on the set performance parameters</p>
	Evidence:	<p><u>Purchasing:</u> Sampled purchased orders Supplier Accreditation Procedure, PCCUS-PRQP-05</p> <p><u>Artificial Insemination:</u> No presented evaluation result for sampled AI technician, L. Bonior</p>

Action: (filled out by organization)

Correction: (immediate)			
----------------------------	--	--	--

when ?		who ?	
--------	--	-------	--

Root cause: (Why did the nonconformity occur; no repetition of the finding)			
--	--	--	--

Corrective: (action to avoid repetition of root cause)			
---	--	--	--

when ?		who ?	
--------	--	-------	--

Auditor's decision of correction and corrective action: (filled out by auditor)

Correction:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implement ation:	
Corrective:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implement ation:	

No.	5	Standard:	ISO 9001	Type:	MIN
-----	---	-----------	----------	-------	-----



Site:		130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog			
Clause no.		8.5.1 (9K)	Process / area:		Milk and Milk Products
Audit results: (filled out by auditor)	Finding:	It could not be established that the annual microbiological tests for all products is being consistently implemented.			
	Evidence:	Latest laboratory microbiological tests was still in April 2021 for all product types.			
Action: (filled out by organization)					
Correction: (immediate)					
	when ?		who ?		
Root cause: (Why did the nonconformity occur; no repetition of the finding)					
Corrective: (action to avoid repetition of root cause)					
	when ?		who ?		
Auditor's decision of correction and corrective action: (filled out by auditor)					
Correction:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:
Corrective:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:

No.	6	Standard:	ISO 9001	Type:	MIN
Site:	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
Clause no.	8.5.1 (9K); 8.6 (9K)	Process / area:	Milk and Milk Products		



Audit results: (filled out by auditor)	Finding:	<p>The following lapses were noted:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. There is a need for the concerned personnel to familiarize with the requirements of FDA Circular No. 2013-010, Revised Guidelines for the Assessment of Microbiological Quality of Processed Foods, to check if actual laboratory results are within the required tolerance for milk products. 2. It could not also be ensured that all required tests as per FDA Circular No. 2013-010 are strictly enforced
	Evidence:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. No comparison as to whether actual results are still within required tolerance. No reference standard requirement is described in the lab Test Certificates 2. Requirements for pasteurized milk in the circular 2013-010 are tests for coliform, salmonella, listeria monocytogenes and SPC/ APC. Only APC, E. Coli and Coliform were tested. Salmonella was not included.

Action: (filled out by organization)

Correction: (immediate)			
	when ?		who ?
Root cause: (Why did the nonconformity occur; no repetition of the finding)			
Corrective: (action to avoid repetition of root cause)			
	when ?		who ?

Auditor's decision of correction and corrective action: (filled out by auditor)

Correction:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:	
Corrective:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:	

No.	7	Standard:	ISO 9001	Type:	MIN
Site:	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
Clause no.	8.5.1 (9K); 9.1.1 (9K)	Process / area:	CBED		
Audit results: (filled out by auditor)	Finding:	It could not be established that evaluation of the farm sites of recipient of CBIN program is properly conducted.			



	Evidence:	No evidence of the Evaluation Form as required in the Quality Plan for the beneficiary QUENSCUP Agrarian Reform Beneficiaries and Marginal Farmers Cooperative.				
Action: (filled out by organization)						
Correction: (immediate)						
	when ?		who ?			
Root cause: (Why did the nonconformity occur; no repetition of the finding)						
Corrective: (action to avoid repetition of root cause)						
	when ?		who ?			
Auditor's decision of correction and corrective action: (filled out by auditor)						
Correction:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:	
Corrective:	Date:		Effective (E) / Accepted (A)		Evidence of implementation:	

- Note 1: Corrections / immediate actions (C) are a rapid solution to close the finding of nonconformity (NC) or (MiN)
- Note 2: Root cause analysis is mandatory for major nonconformities (NC) and minor nonconformities (MiN)
- Note 3: Corrective actions (CA) serve to eliminate the root cause (RC) and not the finding
- Note 4: In the case of major nonconformities (NC) the effectiveness (E) of the corrective action (CA) has to be confirmed. In the case of a minor nonconformity (MiN), corrective actions have to be accepted (A).
- Note 5: In the case of major nonconformities (NC), the effectiveness of the corrective action (CA) shall be verified during a re-audit.

Opportunities for improvement and positive aspects

No.	Standard	Clause no.	Type	Area / Process	Statement
1	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
	ISO 9001	6.2 (9K)	I	Quality Objectives	<p>The following shall be included Performance Indicator:</p> <p>HR/Training:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accomplishment of Training Plan (currently, target was set but this is not part of the system's official KPI) <p>Customer Care:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Response time in addressing customer complaints
2	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
	ISO 9001	7.1.3 (9K)	I	Maintenance	<p>There is a need to ensure that following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Keeping adequate evidence of the implementation of the preventive maintenance plan. - Review the plan to make it more practicable. Noted that there were equipment seldom used i.e. tractors, grass harvesters, trailers and etc but checklist involves daily inspection
3	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
	ISO 9001	7.1.4 (9K) 7.5	I	GIP – Institutional Herd	<p>To be checked during next visit the documentation of the implementation of biosecurity measures into a controlled document and integrating the practice in the QMS to ensure its consistent implementation. Currently, it is still in a memo form which will be discarded after its retention period is reached.</p>
4	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
	ISO 9001	7.1.5 (9K)	I	Milk and Milk Products	<p>To be checked during next visit the determination of the allowable uncertainty or permissible error of measuring devices subjected to calibration in the Calibration Plan for immediate reference</p>



No.	Standard	Clause no.	Type	Area / Process	Statement
5	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
	ISO 9001	7.5.3 (9K)	I	Control of Documented Information	To be checked next audit the following: - Inventory of records that need to be archived or disposed. - Proper storage of records under retention period - Ensuring the revision of forms follows the document control system. Case-in-point: Trip ticket, PCCUS-PRQF-24 Masterlist: Rev 0 Used: Rev 1
6	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
	ISO 9001	8.3 (9K)	I	Research and Development	To be checked during next audit a copy at hand at the center for the minutes or recorded results of in-house review conducted at Central Office by RDD as evidence of verification/ validation activities conducted.
7	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
	ISO 9001	8.7 (9K)	I	Bull Loan	Consider ensuring that quitting the bull loan program is formalized. Case-in-point: Reg ID No: 2JMF16010
8	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
	ISO 9001	6.1 (9K)	I	CBED	May consider to review the Risk and Opportunity Assessment specifically on the monitoring and evaluation process considering the quality objective targets related to low adoption of technology by farmers and their milk production are still unmet.
9	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
	ISO 9001	8.5.1 (9K)	I	CBED	To be checked during next audit the documented system for the Grow Out program of the unit, which is different from the Dairy Module program.



No.	Standard	Clause no.	Type	Area / Process	Statement
10	130623-01 PHILIPPINE CARABAO CENTER AT UBAY STOCK FARM, Republic of the Philippines - 6315 Ubay, Bohol, Ubay Stock Farm, Lomangog				
	ISO 9001	8.5.1 (9K)	I	CBED	May consider to include the CBIN system in the CBED Quality Plan. What is only described in the plan is the usual animal dispersal which is the Coop Conduit Scheme

General

If Minor nonconformities identified in the last audit are not closed in an acceptable manner, they must be rated as Nonconformities (re-audit required).

Information on findings management in sampling and multi-site certification

The management representative of the management system must check whether systematic corrective actions to close a root cause can be applied in a preventive manner to other affected sites. This is required for findings from internal and external audits.

In sampling certification, the TMS auditor will select and audit other sites in the next audit cycle and consequently cannot verify on site the effectiveness of the corrective actions from the last audit cycle.

Given this, during the next internal audits carried out at the sites concerned, the management representative of the management system must verify on site the effectiveness/acceptance of the corrective actions taken to address **Nonconformities**, **Minor nonconformities** and **Opportunities for improvement**, if any.

The results must be recorded and submitted to the TMS auditor at the next audit to ensure the auditor can verify the effectiveness of the corrective actions initiated.

Note to customer

When a nonconformity occurs:

- determine if similar nonconformities exist or could potentially occur throughout the management system, or if this is only a singular case
- review the effectiveness of the corrective actions internally (e.g. internal audits)
- update risks and opportunities determined during planning, and their corresponding actions